IAN S. FORRESTER QC LL.D.
A Scot without Borders

Liber Amicorum - Volume I

Editors
Sir David Edward
Jacquelyn MacLennan
Assimakis Komninos

© Concurrences Review, 2015
Concurrences Books

**Competition Digest – A Synthesis of EU and National Leading Cases — 2nd Edition**
*Frédéric Jenny* • 2015

**Antitrust in Emerging and Developing Countries**
*Eleanor Fox* - *Harry First* • 2015

**Consumer’s Choice: The Emergence of a Powerful Concept in Competition Law**
*Paul Nihoul* • 2015

**Google, la presse et les journalistes – Analyse interdisciplinaire d’une situation de coopétition**
*Guillaume Sire* • 2015

**Les grands arrêts du droit de la concurrence**
*Laurence Idot* • 2015

**Les pratiques restrictives – L’application de l’article L. 442-6 du code de commerce à travers la jurisprudence**
*Erwann Kerguelen* • 2015

*Nicolas Charbit* - *Elisa Ramundo* • September 2014

**Competition Law on the Global Stage: David Gerber’s Global Competition Law in Perspective**
*Nicolas Charbit* - *Elisa Ramundo* • January 2014

**Day to Day Competition Law: A practical Guide for Businesses**
*Patrick Hubert, Olivier Lecroart, Marie Leppard* • March 2014

**A quoi sert la concurrence ?**
*Martine Behar-Touchais, Nicolas Charbit, Rafael Amaro* • October 2014

*Nicolas Charbit* - *Elisa Ramundo* • January 2013

_All books are published in print and electronic format._
Foreword

Sir David Edward
Jacquelyn MacLennan
Assimakis Komninios

It is a great honour and a special delight to be able to present this Liber Amicorum to Ian Stewart Forrester QC LL.D. on the occasion of his 70th birthday.

Ian comes from a formidable family of Scottish Presbyterian ministers and professors of divinity in whose footsteps he has followed as an elder and regular preacher at St Andrew’s Church of Scotland in Brussels. While firmly rooted in the faith of his ancestors, the intellectual rigour of David Hume and Adam Smith, and the civil law traditions of Scots law, he has, like so many Scots down the ages, sought broader horizons – mainly in Brussels, but now in Luxembourg, with more than a passing dalliance with the common law in New York and London, as well as the cultural life of Japan and the byways of Serbian politics. His endless good spirits and quirky sense of humour have made him friends as well as professional connections all over the world.

Ian was born in Glasgow in 1945, the son of a well-loved and respected schoolmaster and outstanding cricketer – one talent that Ian did not, as far as we know, inherit. The youngest child of the family, who lost his mother tragically early, he was educated at Kelvinside Academy and Glasgow University where he took the traditional Scottish general arts degree (MA 1965) followed by a degree in law (LL.B. 1967). This was a glittering period in the annals of the University, marked by debating successes with the late Alan Rodger (Lord Rodger of Earlsferry) and later, in a North American debating tour, with James Douglas-Hamilton (Lord Selkirk of Douglas). He continued his studies at Tulane University (MCL 1969), Louisiana being carefully selected as a civil law island within a common law sea. Ian returned there to teach on many occasions. It was in New Orleans that he met Sandra Keegan, who became his wife.

Before returning to Scotland after Tulane, Ian spent some time as an intern with Davis Polk in New York, and then returned to prepare for the Scots Bar as the ‘devil’ (pupil) of David Edward. But his time with Davis Polk had brought him into a case involving a Palestinian hijacked plane, which continued to take him to places like Beirut in the
1970s. This was somewhat disconcerting for his devil-master, while opening new casements onto the foam of international practice. Despite these distractions, Ian was admitted to the Scots Bar in 1972, and ‘took silk’ (becoming a QC) in 1988. In the meantime, he took the New York Bar in 1977, and he was later admitted to the English Bar in 1996.

Ian had moved in 1973 to Cleary Gottlieb in Brussels as one of the first generation of UK lawyers who arrived there when the UK joined the European Communities. For the next forty-two years Brussels was to be his home. It is where he raised a family, together with Sandra, becoming the proud father of two sons, Alexander and James, both of whom have resisted the law to date, despite bedtime stories which, Ian confessed, were a soporific means for him to find the clearest expression of his arguments in the case before him at the time.

Meanwhile, he moved from Big Law to Boutique Law, creating Forrester & Norall with Chris Norall, later joined by Alastair Sutton, and then back to Big Law when Forrester Norall & Sutton merged with White & Case. His appointment to the Luxembourg bench will round off Ian’s illustrious career as a practitioner.

Ian belongs to the generation that ‘made’ the English-speaking competition law bar in Brussels, until then the monopoly of a few continental law professors and some Belgian French-speaking lawyers. He was fortunate to participate in many of the leading cases in the formation of key principles of EU law, particularly EU competition law. Examples are *Bosman* on freedom of movement in sport; *Bullock (Distillers)* on restricting exports through discriminatory pricing; *GSK* on parallel trade of pharmaceutical products; *Servier* and *Pfizer* on the precautionary principle; *Magill*, *IMS Health* and *Microsoft* on the interface of competition law and intellectual property law, and in particular, on compulsory licensing; *Rambus* on standard setting bodies and Article 102; *Intel* on unilateral conduct/discounts; *Chalkor* on the standard of judicial review of Commission decisions; and *Servier* on what promises to be a defining case in EU law on reverse settlements.

Ian has not just lived these cases professionally but also academically. He toured the amphitheatres and debated these and other cases with students, professors and researchers. There was never a conference he declined, to the despair of his faithful secretary and PA, Pauline Tart, who had to manage an unmanageable calendar.

Ian is also a prolific writer of seminal articles. His ‘Laicisation of Community Law - Self Help and the Rule of Reason: How Competition Law Is and Could be Applied’, co-authored with Chris Norall and published in 1984, remains a must-read for students of EU competition law. His articles on the modernization of EU competition law, when Regulation 1/2003 was being prepared, and on due process in EU competition law enforcement have also been influential, and he has written about the EU judicial system from a comparative law perspective.
Ian is generous with his time and talents and has been a mentor to many younger lawyers. A typical scene is Ian in an office full of papers and books surrounded by younger colleagues discussing a case. He has had a long association with the Jessup Moot Court and has also been the head of White & Case’s global pro bono practice. He has also been a trustee and strong supporter of the European Baroque Orchestra, and recently embarked on a new career side line as narrator in ‘The Snowman’ concert and Master of Ceremonies at the Brussels Christmas Carol Concert.

His many qualities have been recognized in his appointment as Honorary Professor of European Law and the award of an LL.D. at his alma mater the University of Glasgow, and as an Honorary Bencher of the Middle Temple.

This Liber Amicorum is an occasion to mark the outstanding merits of a remarkable man and express the long lasting, deep, affectionate friendship by three generations of colleagues in this preface and in the contributions themselves. In this point of transition in an extraordinarily full professional life, we wish Ian all the best for an ever fruitful and rewarding time at the EU Bench.

David, Jacquelyn and Makis
Contributors

Cecilia Álvarez Rigaudías
Pfizer

Josef Azizi
University of Vienna

Barry Baines
State of New York

Jacques Bourgeois
Sidley Austin, College of Europe

Merijn Chamon
University of Gent

Claus-Dieter Ehlermann
WilmerHale

Alfonso Gutierrez
Uría Menéndez

Patrick Hugg
Loyola University College of Law

Sir Francis G. Jacobs
King’s College London

Colin MacKay
BBC Radio Scotland

Jacquelyn MacLennan
White & Case

Paul Mahoney
European Court of Human Rights

Niamh Nic Shuibhne
Edinburgh Law School

Isao Noishiki
Matsushita Electric Industrial Co.

Christopher Norall
Forrester Norall & Sutton

José Pérez Santos
Uría Menéndez

Robert Reich
University of California at Berkeley

Sir Konrad Schiemann
Formerly, European Court of Justice

Dean Spielmann
European Court of Human Rights

Pauline Tart
White & Case

Mathieu Vancaillie
Ashurst

Michel Waelbroeck
Université Libre de Bruxelles

Jo Weiss
White & Case
Table of Contents

Foreword......................................................................................................................V
Contributors .............................................................................................................IX
Table of Contents .....................................................................................................XI
Ian S. Forrester QC LLD. Biography .................................................................XIII

Part I - Salutations - Tributes

Tribute.......................................................................................................................3
FRANCIS G. JACOBS

Pre-lunch oration from Saturday 27th June 2009
(The day after the award of his LLD by the University of Glasgow) ..............5
COLIN MACKAY

Starting a law firm with Ian Forrester: a memoir ..............................................9
CHRISTOPHER NORALL

Tribute......................................................................................................................13
ROBERT B. REICH

An unfinished journey ............................................................................................15
PAULINE TART

Part II - EU Law & Policies

Should the EU judiciary be decentralized? ............................................................23
JOSEF AZIZI

The Union interest: a hidden persuader? ..............................................................57
Jacques Bourgeois and Merijn Chamon
The outer limits of the competences under Article 114 TFEU ...............................69
CLAUSS-DIETER EHLERMANN

Evolving constitutional pluralism in Europe:
the judicial conversation advances? .................................................................97
PATRICK R. HUGG

► Better safe than sorry: the dangers of too much precaution revisited ...............123
JACQUELYN MACLENNAN

In search of a status: where does the jobseeker fit in EU free movement law? ....139
NIAMH NIC SHUIBHNE

The Google Spain judgment and the right to be forgotten .................................153
JOSÉ PÉREZ SANTOS, ALFONSO GUTIERREZ AND CECILIA ÁLVAREZ

The contribution of religion to the building of the European Union ....................175
KONRAD SCHIEMANN

Israel’s occupation of Palestine and the EU reaction:
towards a common European policy .................................................................187
MICHIEL WAELEBROECK

Part III - Human Rights - Intellectual Property - Other

Interim orders against healthcare professionals
in disciplinary proceedings (in the United Kingdom) ........................................209
BARRY BAINES

► Flogging a dead horse: the appropriate human rights policy
for judicial treatment of competition fines ......................................................225
PAUL MAHONEY

Who should own patentable inventions and copyrightable
works created during employment? .................................................................241
ISAO NOISHIKI

Copyright and human rights ............................................................................255
DEAN SPIELMANN

► For the love of God: the value of advocati pauperum
From poor tenants of the lands of Grenok to overturning ‘don’t ask, don’t tell’ ..........271
JO WEISS

Contributors’ Bios .............................................................................................279

► GO TO TABLE OF CONTENTS

Ian S. Forrester  |  A Scot without Borders - Liber Amicorum - Volume I
e-Competitions is the only online resource that provides consistent coverage of antitrust cases from 55 jurisdictions, organized into a searchable database structure. e-Competitions concentrates on cases summaries taking into account that in the context of a continuing growing number of sources there is a need for factual information, i.e., case law.

- 12,000 case summaries
- 2,600 authors
- 55 countries covered
- 24,000 subscribers

e-Competitions is structured as a database. The editors make a sophisticated technical and legal work on all articles by tagging these with key words, drafting abstracts and writing html code to increase Google ranking. There is a team of antitrust lawyers – PhD and judges clerks - and a team of IT experts. e-Competitions makes comparative law possible. Thanks to this expert editorial work, it is possible to search and compare cases.

e-Competitions draws upon highly distinguished editors, all leading experts in national or international antitrust. Advisory Board Members include: Sir Christopher Bellamy, Ioanis Lianos (UCL), Eleanor Fox (NYU), Damien Géradin (Tilburg University), Barry Hawk (Fordham University) Fred Jenny (OECD), Jacqueline Riffault-Silk (Cour de cassation), Wouter Wils (DG COMP), etc.

- Association of European Competition Law Judges: The AECLJ is a forum for judges of national Courts specializing in antitrust case law. Members timely feed e-Competitions with just released cases.
- Academics partners: Antitrust research centres from leading universities write regularly in e-Competitions: University College London, King’s College London, Queen Mary University, etc.
- Law firms: Global law firms and antitrust niche firms write detailed cases summaries specifically for e-Competitions: Allen & Overy, DLA Piper, Jones Day, Norton Rose Fulbright, Skadden Arps, White & Case, etc.
The Institute of Competition Law

The Institute of Competition Law is a publishing company, founded in 2004 by Dr. Nicolas Charbit, based in Paris and New-York. The Institute cultivates scholarship and discussion about antitrust issues though publications and conferences. Each publication and event is supervised by editorial boards and scientific or steering committees to ensure independence, objectivity, and academic rigor. Thanks to this management, the Institute has become one of the few think tanks in Europe to have significant influence on antitrust policies.

AIM

The Institute focuses government, business and academic attention on a broad range of subjects which concern competition laws, regulations and related economics.

BOARDS

To maintain its unique focus, the Institute relies upon highly distinguished editors, all leading experts in national or international antitrust: Bill Kovacic, Mario Monti, Eleanor Fox, Barry Hawk, Laurence Idot, Fred Jenny, etc.

AUTHORS

3,800 authors, from 55 jurisdictions.

PARTNERS

- Universities: University College London, King’s College London, Queen Mary University, Paris Sorbonne Panthéon-Assas, etc.

EVENTS


ONLINE VERSION

Concurrences website provides all articles published since its inception.

PUBLICATIONS

The Institute publishes Concurrences Journal, a print and online quarterly peer-reviewed journal dedicated to EU and national competitions laws. e-Competitions is a bi-monthly antitrust news bulletin covering 55 countries. The e-Competitions database contains over 12,000 case summaries from 2,600 authors.
It is with great pleasure that we present this Liber Amicorum to Ian Stewart Forrester QC LL.D. on the year of his 70th birthday and at this point of transition in his extraordinary professional life. This two-volume Liber Amicorum is a collection of tributes to Ian Forrester’s outstanding career and of a series of articles signed by prominent academics and practitioners around the world on the most current topics in EU law and policies, competition law, human rights and intellectual property.

Born in Glasgow from a Scottish family, Ian Forrester practiced law in multiple cities, Brussels, New York and London, to mention some. He arrived in Brussels in 1973 as one of the first generation of UK lawyers at the time when the UK joined the European Union. He participated in many of the leading cases in the formation of key principles of EU law, particularly EU competition law such as Bosman, Bullock (Distillers), GlaxoSmithKline, Servier, Pfizer, Magill, IMS Health and Microsoft. Ian Forrester lived these and other cases professionally and academically, debating them with students, professors and researchers. He has been a mentor to many younger lawyers and is also a prolific writer of seminal articles. His good spirits and quirky sense of humour have made him friends and professional connections all over the world and this Liber Amicorum is an occasion to mark the outstanding merits of a remarkable man and express the long lasting and affectionate friendship.